

Non-abelian Chabauty for the thrice-punctured line

Martin Lüdtké

Rijksuniversiteit Groningen

Belgian-Dutch Junior Algebraic Geometry seminar

Leiden

14 October 2022

Introduction: The S -unit equation

Non-abelian Chabauty

Refined non-abelian Chabauty

Selmer schemes

Chabauty–Kim for $\mathbb{P}^1 \setminus \{0, 1, \infty\}$ in depth 2

Further developments in higher depth

j/w Alex Best, *Alex Betts*, Theresa Kumpitsch, Angus McAndrew, Lie Qian, Elie Studnia, Yujie Xu

Southwest Center
for Arithmetic Geometry

ARIZONA WINTER SCHOOL 2020

Department of Mathematics
The University of Arizona*

Deadline to apply for funding:
November 8, 2019

<http://swc.math.arizona.edu>

NONABELIAN CHABAUTY

Jennifer Balakrishnan
Computational tools for quadratic Chabauty

Bas Edixhoven
Geometric quadratic Chabauty

Minhyong Kim
Foundations of nonabelian Chabauty

David Zureick-Brown
Classical Chabauty

with **Bjorn Poonen**, Clay Lecturer

TUCSON, MARCH 7-11, 2020

Funded by the National Science Foundation
Supported by the National Security Agency
Organized in partnership
with the Clay Mathematics Institute

1. Introduction: The S -unit equation

The S -unit equation

Setup:

- ▶ S finite set of primes
- ▶ $\mathbb{Z}_S = \{n \in \mathbb{Q} : v_p(n) \geq 0 \forall p \notin S\}$ ring of S -integers
- ▶ $\mathbb{Z}_S^\times = \{n \in \mathbb{Q}^\times \text{ containing only prime factors in } S\}$
 $= \{\pm \prod_{\ell \in S} \ell^{e_\ell} : e_\ell \in \mathbb{Z}\}$
group of S -units

S -unit equation

$$x + y = 1 \quad \text{with } x, y \in \mathbb{Z}_S^\times$$

Solutions are S -units x such that $1 - x$ is also an S -unit.

The S -unit equation

S -unit equation

$$x + y = 1 \quad \text{with } x, y \in \mathbb{Z}_S^\times$$

If x is a solution, so are $1 - x$ and $1/x$, since

$$1 - 1/x = -(1 - x)/x.$$

Thus, solutions come in S_3 -orbits

$$x, \quad 1 - x, \quad \frac{1}{x}, \quad \frac{1}{1 - x}, \quad \frac{x - 1}{x}, \quad \frac{x}{x - 1}.$$

S -unit equation

$$x + y = 1 \quad \text{with } x, y \in \mathbb{Z}_S^\times$$

Solutions for small sets S :

- ▶ $S = \emptyset$: no solutions
- ▶ $S = \{\ell\}$, ℓ odd: no solutions
 $S = \{2\}$: solutions $\{2, -1, 1/2\} = S_3$ -orbit of 2
- ▶ $S = \{\ell, q\}$, both odd: no solutions
 $S = \{2, q\}$
 - ▶ $q = 2^n + 1 > 3$ Fermat prime: S_3 -orbits of 2 and q
 - ▶ $q = 2^n - 1 > 3$ Mersenne prime: S_3 -orbits of 2 and 2^n
 - ▶ $q = 3$: S_3 -orbits of 2, 3, 4, 9
 - ▶ all other q : only the S_3 -orbit of 2

The S -unit equation

Geometric re-interpretation:

Solutions of the S -unit equation are elements of $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$, where

$$\mathcal{X} = \mathbb{P}_{\mathbb{Z}_S}^1 \setminus \{0, 1, \infty\}.$$

Theorem (Siegel 1929)

$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$ is finite.

The S -unit equation

Siegel's proof was not effective:

- ▶ no method to compute $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$
- ▶ no upper bound on $\#\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$

Siegel's Theorem was reproved by Minhyong Kim in 2005 using a non-abelian generalisation of Chabauty's method.

2. Non-abelian Chabauty

Non-abelian Chabauty

Fix auxiliary prime $p \notin S$.

Chabauty–Kim method yields nested sequence

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) \supseteq \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,1} \supseteq \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,2} \supseteq \dots \supseteq \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$$

The $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}$ are zero sets of *Coleman-analytic* functions on $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)$

Theorem (Kim 2005)

$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}$ is finite for $n \gg 0$.

\Rightarrow Siegel's Theorem

(This is not known for more general curves but is implied by various standard conjectures.)

Conjecture (Kim)

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_S, n = \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) \text{ for } n \gg 0.$$

The Chabauty–Kim method can be made effective and the conjecture can be tested in some cases.

However:

- ▶ Complexity increases with n
- ▶ Larger sets S require larger *depth* n to get finiteness

Depth 1: shows finiteness only for $S = \emptyset$:

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{\emptyset,1} &= \{z \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) : \log(z) = \log(1-z) = 0\} \\ &= \{\zeta_6, \zeta_6^{-1}\} \cap \mathbb{Z}_p.\end{aligned}$$

This agrees with $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}) = \emptyset$ if and only if $p \equiv 2 \pmod{3}$.

Depth 2:

Theorem (Dan-Cohen, Wewers 2015)

Explicit equations defining $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,2}$ for $\#S \leq 1$:

$$\begin{aligned}\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{\emptyset,2} &= \{z \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) : \log(z) = \log(1-z) = \text{Li}_2(z) = 0\}, \\ \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{\{\ell\},2} &= \{z \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) : 2 \text{Li}_2(z) = \log(z) \log(1-z)\}.\end{aligned}$$

Here, $\text{Li}_2(z)$ denotes the p -adic dilogarithm, i.e. the iterated Coleman integral

$$\text{Li}_2(z) = \int_0^z \frac{dt}{t} \frac{dt}{1-t}.$$

3. Refined non-abelian Chabauty

Betts–Dogra (2019): refinement of CK method

The refined Chabauty–Kim method yields a nested sequence

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) \supseteq \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,1}^{\min} \supseteq \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,2}^{\min} \supseteq \dots \supseteq \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$$

with

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}^{\min} \subseteq \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}.$$

- ▶ $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}^{\min}$ may be finite even if $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}$ is not
- ▶ $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}^{\min}$ may agree with $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$ even if $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}$ does not

Conjecture (Refined Kim conjecture)

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}^{\min} = \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) \text{ for } n \gg 0$$

Remark

Refined CK detects local obstructions: If $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_\ell) = \emptyset$ for some $\ell \notin S$ or $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Q}_\ell) = \emptyset$ for some $\ell \in S$, then $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}^{\min} = \emptyset = \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$ automatically.

In particular, for $\mathcal{X} = \mathbb{P}^1 \setminus \{0, 1, \infty\}$:

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}^{\min} = \emptyset = \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) \text{ whenever } 2 \notin S,$$

since $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{F}_2) = \mathbb{P}^1(\mathbb{F}_2) \setminus \{0, 1, \infty\} = \emptyset$, hence $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_2) = \emptyset$.

Theorem (Best, Betts, Kumpitsch, L., McAndrew, Qian, Studnia, Xu (Arizona 2020)¹)

(1) *Depth 1: explicit equations defining $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,1}^{\min}$ for $S = \{2\}$:*

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{\{2\},1}^{\min} = S_3 \cdot \{z \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) : \log(z) = 0\}.$$

(2) *Depth 2: explicit equations defining $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,2}^{\min}$ for $S = \{2\}$ and $S = \{2, q\}$:*

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{\{2\},2}^{\min} = S_3 \cdot \{z \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) : \log(z) = \text{Li}_2(z) = 0\}$$

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{\{2,q\},2}^{\min} = S_3 \cdot \{z \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) : a_{2,q} \text{Li}_2(z) = a_{q,2} \text{Li}_2(1-z)\}$$

for certain constants $a_{2,q}, a_{q,2} \in \mathbb{Q}_p$.

¹*Refined Selmer equations for the thrice-punctured line in depth two,*
<https://arxiv.org/abs/2106.10145>

Theorem (cont.)

(3) *Bound on number of solutions for $p = 3$: $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_3)_{\{2,q\},2}^{\min}$ consists of at most two S_3 -orbits of points. Equality holds iff*

$$\min\{v_3(a_{2,q}), v_3(a_{q,2})\} = 1 + v_3(\log(q)). \quad (\dagger)$$

Corollary

If $q > 3$ is a Fermat or Mersenne prime, then the refined Kim conjecture holds for $S = \{2, q\}$ and $p = 3$ in depth 2:

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_3)_{\{2,q\},2}^{\min} = \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}[\frac{1}{2q}]).$$

The coefficients $a_{2,q}$, $a_{q,2}$ can be calculated algorithmically. We implemented² the algorithm in SAGE and used the criterion (†) to verify:

Theorem (BBKLMcQSX)

The refined Kim conjecture holds in depth 2 for $S = \{2, q\}$ and $p = 3$ when q is one of

19, 37, 53, 107, 109, 163, 181, 199, 269, 271, 379,
431, 433, 487, 523, 541, 577, 593, 631, 701, 739,
757, 809, 811, 829, 863, 883, 919, 937, 971, 991.

²https://github.com/martinluedtke/dcw_coefficients

4. Selmer schemes

The sets $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}$ are defined using a diagram as follows:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) & \hookrightarrow & \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) \\ j_S \downarrow & & \downarrow j_p \\ \text{Sel}_{S,n}(\mathcal{X}) & \xrightarrow{\text{loc}_p} & H_f^1(G_p, U_n^{\text{ét}}) \end{array}$$

The localisation map loc_p is an algebraic map between (the \mathbb{Q}_p -points of) affine spaces over \mathbb{Q}_p .

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n} = \{z \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) : j_p(z) \in \text{loc}_p(\text{Sel}_{S,n}(\mathcal{X}))\}.$$

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) & \hookrightarrow & \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) \\ j_S \downarrow & & \downarrow j_p \\ \text{Sel}_{S,n}(\mathcal{X}) & \xrightarrow{\text{loc}_p} & H_f^1(G_p, U_n^{\text{ét}}) \end{array}$$

Theorem

If the localisation map loc_p is not dominant, then $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}$ is finite.

Proof (Sketch).

If $\text{loc}_p(\text{Sel}_{S,n}(\mathcal{X}))$ is not Zariski-dense, there exists a function $f \neq 0$ on $H_f^1(G_p, U_n^{\text{ét}})$ vanishing on $\text{loc}_p(\text{Sel}_{S,n}(\mathcal{X}))$. Then $f \circ j_p$ is nonzero and p -adic analytic on each residue disk of $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)$. It has only finitely many zeroes and vanishes on $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$. \square

$$\begin{array}{ccc}
 \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) & \hookrightarrow & \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) \\
 j_S \downarrow & & \downarrow j_p \\
 \mathrm{Sel}_{S,n}(\mathcal{X}) & \xrightarrow{\mathrm{loc}_p} & H_f^1(G_p, U_n^{\acute{e}t})
 \end{array}$$

Remark

The schemes $\mathrm{Sel}_S(\mathcal{X})$ and $H_f^1(G_p, U^{\acute{e}t})$ are moduli spaces of torsors under the \mathbb{Q}_p -pro-unipotent étale fundamental group $\pi_1^{\mathbb{Q}_p}(X_{\overline{\mathbb{Q}}}, b)$ (for some base point $b \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$), and the vertical maps j_S and j_p assign to each point x of \mathcal{X} its path torsor:

$$x \mapsto \pi_1^{\mathbb{Q}_p}(X_{\overline{\mathbb{Q}}}; b, x).$$

Working in depth n corresponds to replacing the fundamental group by its n -th lower central series quotient.

Refined Selmer schemes

We also have ℓ -adic localisation maps for $\ell \in S$:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) & \hookrightarrow & \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Q}_\ell) \\ \downarrow j_S & & \downarrow j_\ell \\ \text{Sel}_{S,n}(\mathcal{X}) & \xrightarrow{\text{loc}_\ell} & H^1(G_\ell, U_n^{\text{ét}}). \end{array}$$

The **refined Selmer scheme** is defined as the subscheme $\text{Sel}_{S,n}^{\min}(\mathcal{X}) \subseteq \text{Sel}_{S,n}(\mathcal{X})$ of points α satisfying local conditions at primes in S :

$$\text{loc}_\ell(\alpha) \in j_\ell(\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Q}_\ell))^{\text{Zar}} \quad \text{for all } \ell \in S.$$

Then we can define the **refined Chabauty–Kim locus**

$$\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,n}^{\min} = \{z \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) : j_p(z) \in \text{loc}_p(\text{Sel}_{S,n}^{\min}(\mathcal{X}))\}.$$

5. Chabauty–Kim for $\mathbb{P}^1 \setminus \{0, 1, \infty\}$ in depth 2

For the thrice-punctured line, the Selmer scheme in depth 2 is given by

$$\mathrm{Sel}_{S,2}(\mathcal{X}) = \mathbb{A}^S \times \mathbb{A}^S.$$

The localisation map for $\ell \in S$ is the projection

$$\begin{aligned} \mathrm{loc}_\ell: \mathbb{A}^S \times \mathbb{A}^S &\rightarrow \mathbb{A}^2, \\ ((x_\ell)_{\ell \in S}, (y_\ell)_{\ell \in S}) &\mapsto (x_\ell, y_\ell). \end{aligned}$$

Chabauty–Kim for $\mathbb{P}^1 \setminus \{0, 1, \infty\}$ in depth 2

The map $j_\ell: X(\mathbb{Q}_\ell) \rightarrow \mathbb{A}^2$ is given by

$$j_\ell(z) = (v_\ell(z), v_\ell(1 - z)).$$

Lemma

$$j_\ell(X(\mathbb{Q}_\ell))^{\text{Zar}} = \{x = 0\} \cup \{y = 0\} \cup \{x = y\} \text{ in } \mathbb{A}^2$$

Proof.

If $z \in X(\mathbb{Q}_\ell)$, then $z + z' = 1$ with $z, z' \in \mathbb{Q}_\ell^\times$.

Then $0 = v_\ell(1) \geq \min\{v_\ell(z), v_\ell(z')\}$ with equality if $v_\ell(z) \neq v_\ell(z')$.

$$\Rightarrow v_\ell(z) = 0 \quad \text{or} \quad v_\ell(z') = 0 \quad \text{or} \quad v_\ell(z) = v_\ell(z'). \quad \square$$

Thus, the refined Selmer scheme $\text{Sel}_{S,2}^{\min}(\mathcal{X})$ in depth 2 is the union of $3^{\#S}$ linear subspaces of $\mathbb{A}^S \times \mathbb{A}^S$ of dimension $\#S$, given by refinement conditions

$$x_\ell = 0 \text{ resp. } y_\ell = 0 \text{ resp. } x_\ell = y_\ell$$

for each $\ell \in S$.

Chabauty–Kim for $\mathbb{P}^1 \setminus \{0, 1, \infty\}$ in depth 2

Dan-Cohen, Wewers:

$$\begin{array}{c} z \\ \downarrow \\ (v_\ell(z))_{\ell \in S}, (v_\ell(1-z))_{\ell \in S} \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{ccc} \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) & \hookrightarrow & \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) \\ \downarrow j_S & & \downarrow j_p \\ \mathbb{A}^S \times \mathbb{A}^S & \xrightarrow{\text{loc}_p} & \mathbb{A}^3 \end{array}$$

$$\begin{array}{c} z \\ \downarrow \\ \begin{pmatrix} \log(z) \\ \log(1-z) \\ -\text{Li}_2(z) \end{pmatrix} \end{array}$$

$$\text{loc}_p((x_\ell)_{\ell \in S}, (y_\ell)_{\ell \in S}) = \begin{pmatrix} \sum_{\ell \in S} \log(\ell) x_\ell \\ \sum_{\ell \in S} \log(\ell) y_\ell \\ \sum_{\ell, q \in S} a_{\ell, q} x_\ell y_q \end{pmatrix}$$

If $S = \{2, q\}$, then the localisation map

$$\text{loc}_p: \mathbb{A}^S \times \mathbb{A}^S \rightarrow \mathbb{A}^3$$

has Zariski-dense image.

However, the *refined* Selmer scheme has dimension $\#S = 2$, hence its image in \mathbb{A}^3 is not Zariski-dense.

If $f = 0$ is a nontrivial equation on \mathbb{A}^3 vanishing on $\text{loc}_p(\text{Sel}_{S,2}^{\min}(\mathcal{X}))$, then pulling back along $j_p: \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p) \rightarrow \mathbb{A}^3$ gives a nontrivial equation cutting out $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{S,2}^{\min}$:

$$a_{2,q} \text{Li}_2(z) = a_{q,2} \text{Li}_2(1-z).$$

6. Further developments in higher depth

Kim's conjecture in higher depth

With Alex Betts and Theresa Kumpitsch, building on work by Corwin and Dan-Cohen, we are looking at higher depth.

Theorem (Betts, Kumpitsch, L. 2021)

1. *The Kim conjecture holds for $S = \emptyset$ and all odd primes $p > 3$ in depth $n = p - 3$.*
2. *The refined Kim conjecture holds for $S = \{2\}$ and all odd primes $p > 3$ in depth $n = p - 3$.*

In the second case, equations for $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_p)_{\{2\}, p-3}^{\min}$ (up to S_3 -orbits) are given by

$$\log(z) = 0, \quad \text{Li}_k(z) = 0 \text{ for } 2 \leq k \leq p - 3 \text{ even.}$$

Selmer section conjecture

Let X/\mathbb{Q} be a smooth hyperbolic curve, $b \in X(\mathbb{Q})$, and let $\pi_1^{\text{ét}}(X, b)$ be the profinite étale fundamental group. Every point $x \in X(\mathbb{Q})$ induces a Galois section $s_x: G_{\mathbb{Q}} \rightarrow \pi_1^{\text{ét}}(X, b)$:

$$\begin{array}{ccc} X & & \pi_1(X, b) \\ \text{pr} \downarrow \curvearrowright x & \rightsquigarrow & \text{pr}_* \downarrow \curvearrowright s_x \\ \text{Spec}(\mathbb{Q}) & & G_{\mathbb{Q}} \end{array}$$

Conjecture (Grothendieck 1986)

The map

$$X(\mathbb{Q}) \rightarrow \left(\begin{array}{l} \text{conjugacy classes} \\ \text{of sections of } \text{pr}_* \end{array} \right)$$

is a bijection.

Selmer section conjecture

Let \mathcal{X}/\mathbb{Z}_S be a smooth regular model of X/\mathbb{Q} and $b \in \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$.

Conjecture (Selmer section conjecture)

Let $s: G_{\mathbb{Q}} \rightarrow \pi_1(X, b)$ be a Galois section such that for every prime ℓ , the restriction of s to the local Galois group G_{ℓ} is induced by a point

$$\begin{cases} \text{in } X(\mathbb{Q}_{\ell}) & \text{if } \ell \in S, \\ \text{in } \mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_{\ell}) & \text{if } \ell \notin S. \end{cases}$$

Then s is induced by a point in $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$.

Theorem (Betts, Kumpitsch, L. (in progress))

If \mathcal{X}/\mathbb{Z}_S satisfies the refined Kim conjecture, then it satisfies the Selmer section conjecture.

Corollary

$\mathcal{X} = \mathbb{P}_{\mathbb{Z}_S}^1 \setminus \{0, 1, \infty\}$ satisfies the Selmer section conjecture for $S = \emptyset$ and for $S = \{2\}$.

Uniform bounds in the S -unit equation

Consider the localisation map

$$\text{loc}_p: \text{Sel}_{S,n}^{\min}(\mathcal{X}) \rightarrow H_f^1(G_p, U_n^{\text{ét}}).$$

Betts (2021): The rings of functions on both schemes have a **weight filtration** by finite-dimensional subspaces, and the map

$$\text{loc}_p^\sharp: \mathcal{O}(H_f^1(G_p, U_n^{\text{ét}})) \rightarrow \mathcal{O}(\text{Sel}_{S,n}^{\min}(\mathcal{X}))$$

is filtered. Any $f \neq 0$ in the kernel with weight $\leq m$ yields a Coleman function of weight $\leq m$ vanishing on $\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S)$. Its number of zeroes is bounded in terms of m .

Theorem (Leonhardt, L. (2022))

Let $\mathcal{X} = \mathbb{P}_{\mathbb{Z}_S}^1 \setminus \{0, 1, \infty\}$. There exists a constant $\gamma > 0$ such that

$$\#\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) \leq e^{\gamma s^2 \log(s)^2},$$

where $s = \#S$.

This is worse than the bound $\#\mathcal{X}(\mathbb{Z}_S) \leq 3 \cdot 7^{2s+1}$ due to Evertse.

Thank you